



A Brief Analysis of Neturei Karta Argumentation

Sep 26, 2016 was when the Republican and Democrat candidates debated for the first time this cycle. While the candidates were arguing inside Hofstra University, the Neturei Karta had a protest outside. Rabbi Weiss, who is one of the chief agitators of the gang, gave an interview. I thought I would provide a point by point rebuttal to the drivel. I have transcribed, in order, the bulk of his statements. (His words are in **red**, followed by my thoughts in Black.) Video: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ywBoNilVC6M>

“We are here to convey a message. The Jewish people around the world are not necessarily supporters of the state of Israel.”

Not necessarily, but the [vast majority](#) of Jews do support Israel. Even [J Street](#) which right wingers consider to be evil, purports to support Israel.

“The very religious Jews... are anti-Zionist.”

Some, no doubt. But not all, and perhaps not even most. Unless, of course, the Neturei Karta gets to decide who is and who is not a “very religious Jew”.

“We feel like the continuance of the state of Israel has brought rivers of bloodshed of death for both the Palestinians and the Jews.”

I don't think he cares much about the Palestinians, any more than he does for the people in Pakistan or Rwanda.

Equating the spilled blood of the Jews and Palestinians is as immoral as comparing the blood shed by cops and criminals in an urban jungle.

Approximately [twenty-five thousand](#) Jews have been killed in Israel by her enemies since 1920. Compare that to the six million of the holocaust. That is 240 Jews killed in the holocaust for every Jews killed in Israel. Put another way, on average 260 Jews were killed in Israel by enemy soldiers and terrorists every year for 96 years. This is a drop in the bucket compared to how many Jews died in a single year during the destruction of the second Temple, the Bar Kokhba Revolt, the Crusades, the Chmielnicki massacres, World War One or World War Two. I don't think it will be a great comfort to the mothers of dead IDF soldiers to know that in the marketplace of war, Israel was bought on the cheap, but it is the unavoidable truth.

One last point about the rivers of bloodshed. For the first time in history since the age Hadrian, Ptolemy, and Apuleius the rivers of Jewish blood that have flown have been the dearly-purchased blood of lions, not the deluge that spurts out from feeble sheep at the slaughter.

“Jews have lived together with Muslims and Arabs for hundreds of years”

You call that living? It is more [accurate](#) to say that Arabs have been killing Jews since the time of the first Muslim, Mohamoud. Even when the iron fist of Islam was softened by a velvet glove, it is a matter of course in Islamic Jurisprudence that Jews must be subservient to the dominant Muslims.

“Judaism is a religion [with] subservience to God, and the whole concept of the Zionist state of Israel, of statehood, is a nationalism [of] a mere sixty-odd years; the ideology of Zionism is a hundred odd years.. They hijacked the name Judaism... They are using it to further an ideology... that is flawed... [that is a] selfish and criminal cause. It has nothing to do with our religion. “

This is spurious. God said in Exodus 19:6: “and you shall be to Me a kingdom of priests and a holy nation.” In Deuteronomy 17:14-15: “When you enter the land which the LORD your God gives you, and you possess it and live in it, and you say, 'I will set a king over me like all the nations who are around me,' you shall surely set a king over you whom the LORD your God chooses, one from among your countrymen you shall set as king over yourselves”. Nationalism is old as the Jewish people. There was no “hijacking” of Judaism for the express purpose of inserting the new-fangled idea of nationalism. A hundred odd years ago there was a rekindling of interest in Jewish nationalism. The ancient idea was given a new veneer.

“Its caused a rift between Jews and Muslims. It's a terrible tragedy in the world. The repercussion are worldwide. It's very possible that many of the world conflicts in the Arab and Muslim world that is going between the West and the Arab in the state of Israel.”

Classic anti-Semitism, stolen from the traditional Jew-hating playbook: blame everything on Israel/Jews. Jew haters in Pakistan blame Israel for Middle East unrest. 9/11 and the Paris attack have been blamed on the Jews. Noam Chomsky, premier anti-Semite, said that the Israelis were killing thousands in Venezuela.

“It's a terrible calamity for Muslims Arabs and Jews alike.”

Worse for the Muslims Arabs, one would think. They have to suffer the indignity of having one successful island nation in a sea of failed states.

“[We need] a new approach to this conflict, just like in South Africa.”

Another libelous cliché, [comparing Israel to apartheid-era South Africa](#).

“The existence of the state of Israel is a clear impediment to peace.”

Yes it is, in the way a security guard is an impediment to a burglar.

“With God's help, [we need] a dismantlement.. Just like South Africa was changed in its entirety. And the USSR was changed”

I cannot believe that he truly believes that Israel can simply be dismantled, I assume it to be rhetorical point. In the event, Apartheid South Africa and the USSR are wholly incomparable to Israel. The relative ease with which those two political entities were dissolved could not be replicated here.

“It has to be free country [representing] the will of the indigenous people... the Palestinians.”

The idea that there is an indigenous nation-state of the Palestinians is a commonly-heard falsehood. According to Webster's Dictionary indigenous means: “produced, living, or existing

naturally in a particular region or environment.” That list should include the British, the Turks, the Arabs, the Byzantines, the Romans, and the Jews, to name a few.

“[The Jew] has to be loyal citizen [in this proposed Palestinian state].”

Does he realize that the better part of a million Jews have been ostracized or have fled from the Middle East when Israel became a state. Where does he see Jews living as loyal citizens?

“The exacerbation of anti-Semitism is because of the state [of Israel].”

Undeniably true. If Israel were to disappear from the map, there might be less anti-Semitism. But let us not forget that the main cause of anti-Semitism is Jews. If the Jews were to be so good as to completely disappear from the world, you can be assured that anti-Semitism would fade considerably, and over time it would cease to exist all together. Who today hates the [Hittites](#) or the [Carians](#)? Nobody.

“There are many Jews being beaten today in palestine, in Jerusalem, because they force Jews to go into the military: even boys and girls. Our Jews are brutally beaten and arrested.”

They do not force girls into the military. Boys are forced into the military, as befits a Spartan-like society. A few--very few--of the Ultra-Orthodox Jewish boys are arrested for evading the draft, as befits people who break the law. A few people have been beaten, mainly for resisting arrest or rioting. All in all, they are treated with kid's gloves.